

## 6.2

## Citizenship and Personal, Social and Health Education: Clarifying and Managing their Roles and Relationship

*Jan Campbell and Liz Craft*

At the time of writing, Citizenship had been a statutory National Curriculum subject at Key Stages 3 and 4 for only a few years and schools are at very different stages of implementation. Whilst many are delivering Citizenship as a component of an existing Personal, Social and Health Education (PSHE) programme, a growing number give the subject more and separate curriculum time. The numbers using the GCSE Citizenship Studies specifications to recognise achievement has resulted in the subject becoming the fastest growing qualification subject<sup>1</sup>. Using a joint PSHE-Citizenship approach carries a dual risk: the dilution of PSHE provision *and* non-compliance with the requirements of the programmes of study for Citizenship, especially as there remains confusion about what constitutes PSHE and what constitutes Citizenship (Ofsted, 2003).

This chapter will explore the relationship between Citizenship and PSHE and the essential, distinctive and complementary contributions of each to enabling young people to be personally effective, socially responsible, healthy and active members of their communities. It will identify common ground between the two and suggest areas where planning, training and delivery can be linked.

The focus is on the school curriculum for pupils aged 5–16. It is beyond the scope of the chapter to explore in detail early years or post-16 issues although some aspects of the chapter are also relevant to them. In addition, no attempt has been made to consider the broader political Citizenship agenda. It is important, therefore, to stress that the focus is on Citizenship Education in schools. On occasions we refer to personal and social education (PSE) rather than PSHE. This is where text relates to actual programmes or quotations that pre-date the revision of the National Curriculum when PSE was a common term.

### The aims, values and purposes of education

Education is

*the route to spiritual, moral, social, cultural, physical and mental development, and thus the well-being of the individual . . . a route to equality of opportunity for all, a healthy and just democracy, a productive economy and sustainable development . . . education must enable us to respond positively to the opportunities and challenges of the rapidly changing world in which we live and work. In particular, we need to be prepared to engage as individuals, parents, workers and citizens with economic, social and cultural change . . . (QCA, 1999).*

With the publication of the revised National Curriculum in November 1999, the aims and purposes of the curriculum were, for the first time, fully described. An expansion and explanation of requirements of section 351 of the Education Act 1996 made clear the requirement for schools to provide a curriculum that promotes the development of all learners and 'prepares pupils for the opportunities, responsibilities and experiences of life' in a rapidly changing world.

Such aims are whole organisation responsibilities and are achieved through the ethos of the school, its curriculum and its wider and extra curriculum provision. Each subject has its part to play. But before the revision of the National Curriculum in 1998, it could be argued that the sum of the subjects and statutory requirements did not fully prepare pupils for life in the real world.

Prior to the revision of the National Curriculum, most schools had some provision called PSE or PSHE. In addition to personal and social education, this frequently included some aspects of Citizenship together with health education, careers education and guidance, industrial and economic understanding and environmental education. In all but a few schools this provision failed to ensure that young people understood the political and economic realities of their communities and how to engage with and act within them. They were not, therefore, equipped to contribute to society as citizens with rights, responsibilities and duties.

### **Towards Citizenship and a new framework for PSHE**

In 1999, the then Secretary of State for Education and Employment, David Blunkett, took the decision to make Citizenship a new National Curriculum subject at Key Stages 3 and 4 with effect from August 2002. New national frameworks for PSHE and Citizenship for Key Stages 1 and 2 and for PSHE for Key Stages 3 and 4 were also introduced and took effect from August 2000 alongside the introduction of the revised National Curriculum in schools.

These frameworks, whilst themselves non-statutory, contained statutory elements of sex and careers education, included areas of health education, for example drug education, that was compatible with the programmes of study for science and addressed statutory policy areas such as behaviour, anti-bullying, equal opportunities and race relations.

The introduction of the national frameworks for PSHE and the new subject of Citizenship provided schools with challenges and opportunities. They needed to review their provision to ensure that the values, aims and purposes of the school curriculum were carried through into teaching and learning activities that would be appropriate, relevant and meaningful to the pupils in their particular school community.

### **So what is the difference between PSHE and Citizenship?**

Bernard Crick wrote in 1998 that 'PSE is a necessary but not a sufficient condition for good citizenship'<sup>2</sup>. He went on to elaborate on the links between

PSE and the three guiding principles of Citizenship Education: Social and Moral Responsibility, Community Involvement and Political Literacy. The first constituted common ground between the two subjects, being an essential pre-condition for Citizenship, the second had much common ground between the two but the third, Political Literacy, had distinct and different content from PSE.

Citizenship and PSHE are, therefore, related but different subjects. Each has an essential, but distinct, role in promoting the personal and social development of pupils through planned, coordinated, monitored and evaluated provision.

There are many definitions of both PSHE and of Citizenship. We attempt here to build on some of them to clarify the differences and identify some common ground.

PSHE relates to planned learning opportunities provided by a school to promote the personal and social development of its pupils and their health and well-being. PSHE is likely to be provided through discrete lessons as well as through opportunities provided by the subjects of the National Curriculum, assemblies, the tutorial programme, circle time, special projects and other events that enrich pupils' experiences.

PSHE is concerned with qualities, attitudes, knowledge, understanding and behaviour in the personal domain. It promotes abilities, competencies and skills in relation to oneself and others and deals with issues of social responsibility and morality including respect for the differences between people. PSHE leads to the fostering of self-esteem, self-confidence, independence and empowerment. It promotes informed decision-making. Knowledge and understanding includes that which is concerned with career and education opportunities; personal finance; health – including sexual health and drugs, alcohol and tobacco; safety – including personal safety; relationships and lifestyles – including those different from their own.

Citizenship also contributes to pupils' personal and social development. It has a body of knowledge and skills that is concerned with enabling pupils to engage with political and public policy issues, participate in society and in the democratic process. As well as social, moral and cultural aspects, Citizenship addresses the political, legal and economic dimensions of everyday issues, problems and events within the context of local, national and global communities. Knowledge and understanding includes that which is concerned with legal and human rights and responsibilities; the origins and diversity of the UK; central and local government and public services; elections, voting and the role of parliament in democracy; the world as a global and interdependent community; and the UK's relations with the EU, the Commonwealth and the UN. Citizenship knowledge is underpinned by key concepts and principles<sup>3</sup> and must be acquired as pupils are developing and applying skills of enquiry and communication, participation and responsible action. This interrelationship between knowledge and skills is essential. Citizenship skills must be developed in the context of learning Citizenship knowledge, for Citizenship is an active subject where pupils need opportunities to use and apply their knowledge, understanding and skills to

take action with others on issues that concern them and as informed, critical and responsible members of communities.

### **PSHE and Citizenship: some common ground**

Both Citizenship and PSHE address contemporary issues of relevance and importance to young people and should involve pupils actively throughout the learning process. Both work best where school approaches to planning, review and provision are supported by senior management and a positive organisational ethos which recognises pupils as partners and decision-makers in the education process rather than merely as recipients.

Both Citizenship and PSHE benefit from separate lesson time as well as teaching across the curriculum and through activity in wider school and community life. They are best taught by dedicated, knowledgeable teachers skilled in facilitating active learning approaches who plan teaching and learning activities with clear, measurable outcomes. Both subject areas require all involved to have high expectations of what pupils can achieve in terms of knowledge, skills and understanding. The standards in Citizenship and in PSHE should equate to those in other subjects.

The following sections explore some areas in which schools could plan and co-teach aspects of both subjects whilst retaining the distinctive nature of each, ensuring that both Citizenship-specific and PSHE-specific learning outcomes result.

### **Responding to pupils' needs and priorities: why a coherent whole school approach is required**

Both PSHE and Citizenship develop best where there is a whole school approach to planning and review. Schools can develop a clear and coherent curriculum by using the whole school processes promoted through the National Healthy School Programme, the teacher's guides in the QCA schemes of work for Citizenship and the teacher guide in the PSHE units for Key Stages 1 to 4.

When planning or reviewing the curriculum for PSHE and for Citizenship, the needs and priorities of the pupils should be considered. For example:

- the characteristics of the school community including geographical context, local political context, diversity, inclusion and equal opportunities
- local data on, for example, crime, community safety and health issues such as teenage pregnancy and drug misuse
- school data on, for example, behaviour, bullying and racial incidents
- the views of pupils themselves who should be involved in the identification of curriculum priorities to ensure that provision is relevant and valued by them
- consultation with parents, teachers, governors, the wider community.

Schools may place particular emphasis on those aspects of PSHE and Citizenship that address pupils' needs and concerns. This does not remove the

requirement to address all statutory requirements, but does provide scope to go into more depth where topics or issues are of particular relevance or to use approaches that best capture pupils' interest.

Both Citizenship and PSHE benefit from some separately timetabled, dedicated curriculum time. The contribution of other subjects is important and school and community-based activities, required in Citizenship, are also important to PSHE provision. Other chapters examine how different subjects contribute to Citizenship. Here we focus on how some aspects may be addressed within PSHE without losing the integrity of either.

### Doing Citizenship and PSHE: opportunities for 'real' experiences

Citizenship and PSHE have in common the need to provide opportunities for pupils to learn from real situations with relevance to their lives, now and in the future. In addition, Citizenship requires the active participation of pupils in taking real decisions and actions in the school and wider community context. Pupils should develop skills, knowledge and understanding to:

- *take responsibility* for their learning
- *explore and discuss*<sup>4</sup> issues of topical and personal relevance and consider the varied attitudes and values they encounter
- *make real choices and decisions* in both personal, public and community contexts
- *find information and advice*, for example, related to health or to the law
- *participate in groups* of different sizes and composition, for example, those of same and mixed gender, those including younger or older people, those with people of different abilities
- *meet and work with adults* other than teachers, for example, through visits and with external contributors to lessons and events
- *participate*<sup>4</sup> in learning outside the classroom, taking responsibility and action both in the school and in the wider community
- *manage change* whether changing relationships and social circumstances, changes in learning environment, changes in community involvement
- *have time to reflect*<sup>4</sup> on what they have learnt about each subject through their experiences in the classroom and beyond.

### Addressing Citizenship and PSHE through topics or issues

Some topics or issues have the potential to engage pupils in learning about both Citizenship and PSHE. For example, issues relating to crime in the community and drug use and misuse can be approached from the personal perspective relating to health and personal responsibility and the public perspective as issues with political, legal, economic and societal or public policy implications.

Some topics relevant to the lives of pupils can be planned from both PSHE and Citizenship angles by using a questioning approach as is demonstrated in

the QCA Scheme of Work for Citizenship at Key Stage 3 (QCA, 2001). Table 1 illustrates how PSHE questions promote enquiry into the personal, social and health aspects of a topic or issue while Citizenship questions promote enquiry into public policy and political aspects of the topic<sup>5</sup>. This distinction between the *personal and social dimension* and the *public and (therefore) political dimension* lies at the crux of the distinction between PSHE and Citizenship.

**Table 1**  
**Approaching an issue from PSHE and Citizenship perspectives**

<b>Topic or issue</b>	<b>Examples of PSHE-specific questions</b>	<b>Examples of Citizenship-specific questions</b>
<b>Drugs</b>	What are the effects of different drugs on my health and on my relationships with others? How could I resist unwanted pressure to smoke or drink alcohol?	What is the law relating to different drugs? How are such laws made and changed? What effect does alcohol-related crime have on my local community? How can we lobby for change?
<b>Sex and relationships</b>	What are the characteristics of a friend? How do different forms of contraception work? Where do I go for advice about relationships?	Who decides how local sexual health services are funded? How is the public consulted about services? How can I get them improved?
<b>Bullying</b>	What do I understand by the term bullying? How should I respond when I see or experience bullying?	How can I help to develop and consult on the anti-bullying policy in my school? How does a bully infringe the human rights of the victim? When does bullying become a crime?
<b>Crime</b>	Do I have the skills to resist pressure to break the law? What is my reaction when I see the results of vandalism?	What do I know about crime in my community? Why should law-breakers be punished?
<b>Diversity</b>	How does stereotyping and racism affect me and people I know? How can I challenge discrimination assertively?	How do I understand diversity and how is it represented locally and nationally? How does the law protect people from racism? How can we raise awareness of diversity issues in our schools and wider communities?
<b>The economy</b>	What influences how I spend my money? Who can advise me on budgeting and saving?	What happens to the tax I pay when I buy a CD or DVD? What is the role of financial services in the economy? What impact do government spending decisions have?

## Skills for both Citizenship and PSHE?

Citizenship and PSHE have in common the need to engage pupils actively in the learning process, enabling them to develop the skills to work co-operatively with a wide range of people, to deal with changing relationships in widening social contexts, to explore issues, problems and events that concern them personally, socially and as members of communities, to take responsibility for their actions, and those that affect others, and to take action with others on issues that concern them.

Skills in Citizenship are set out in the National Curriculum programme of study as skills of enquiry and communication, participation and responsible action. To date, the skills in PSHE are less clearly set out and this is likely to be addressed as the national framework develops in future years.

Both Citizenship and PSHE *do* require and promote some similar and some distinct skills – indeed many subjects in the curriculum promote some common skills. Schools should plan how and where opportunities to develop and practise these skills will be provided, how pupils will reflect on these opportunities and how they will be helped to apply what they have learnt and developed to other subjects and situations. The skills include:

- communication skills – including listening, discussion, and providing information to others including peers
- thinking skills – especially critical thinking skills needed to weigh information and evidence and to substantiate arguments
- research skills – investigation and enquiry, asking questions
- analytical skills – evaluation, analysis, interpretation, reflection
- decision-making skills – group and individual
- negotiation and problem-solving skills
- creativity skills – generation of ideas/solutions/suggestions
- improving own learning and performance, working with others, problem-solving.

In addition, Citizenship requires specific skills relating to participation and action within the school and wider community context. This may involve the use of a wide range, some of those above and some additional skills, including:

- initiating, planning and carrying out change/action
- advocacy, pleading a case or cause for self or others
- representation skills, speaking or acting on behalf of others
- voting and other forms of democratic decision-making
- debating (as an extension of mere *discussion* skills), such that young people are able to construct and present coherent arguments and lobby for causes effectively.

The following example illustrates how skills in both Citizenship and PSHE may be developed and practised.

A group of pupils demonstrated that their research and analytical skills needed improving. In Citizenship lessons they were taught how to plan and undertake an investigation. Step by step they were supported in investigating the types of crimes committed in their local area. They collected statistics, interviewed police and magistrates, researched local newspaper stories. They were shown how to analyse and interpret the information, discuss their views and present their findings to others. They reflected on the skills they had developed and undertook self and peer-assessment.

In a PSHE lesson later in the term they referred to the skills learnt and used them to research the effects of smoking on health. This time they worked in groups, reminding each other of the skills and approaches previously developed and transferred them to the PSHE investigation.

### A brief consideration of continuing professional development (CPD)

As for any subject, staff teaching either Citizenship or PSHE need to be confident that they have the knowledge and skills appropriate to the subject. It is beyond the scope of this chapter to address teacher-training issues in any depth but it is appropriate to look briefly at areas where Citizenship and PSHE need separate training provision and where schools can offer CPD that supports both subject areas.

At the time of writing, in contrast to most other subjects, few of the teachers delivering either Citizenship or PSHE have received relevant initial teacher training. However, demand and interest in teacher training and CPD opportunities in both subjects are growing. Uptake of the *National Certificate of CPD for PSHE Teaching*, which was launched in 2002, has been strong and a similar *National Certificate of CPD for Citizenship Teaching* has been piloted. PGCE courses in Citizenship for new teachers have been offered since 2001 and have proved popular and successful in raising the quality and status of the subject in schools. However, most of the training for existing teachers with responsibility for the new subject has been left to schools to organise. Teachers need to be supported in developing knowledge and understanding related, for example, to government, parliament, the economy and the law. These are the areas that were neglected in provision prior to the introduction of Citizenship as a National Curriculum subject and they remain the areas about which teachers report that they feel least comfortable. Those teaching PSHE have different knowledge requirements. For example, they need secure knowledge and understanding related to health issues such as sex and relationships and drug education. The co-publication by Hodder Murray alongside this collection of *Making Sense of Citizenship: a CPD Handbook*, which has been developed by the Citizenship Foundation in collaboration with the Association for Citizenship Teaching and a range of other Citizenship organisations and follows a development project funded by the DFES, should further support those seeking to develop best practice in Citizenship (Huddleston and Kerr, 2006) but they

will need the support of colleagues and the allocation of significant resources if they are to achieve their goals.

Both subjects require teachers who are confident to handle sensitive and controversial issues. Training, and *Making Sense of Citizenship* addresses this, should also address ways of:

- consulting pupils and planning teaching to respond to, for example, learning needs and styles, existing levels of knowledge and skills, the attitudes they hold or encounter
- establishing ground-rules – enabling pupils to discuss, negotiate and agree rules for discussing and working together
- responding to spontaneous issues raised by pupils, perhaps in relation to a topical issue or event
- challenging prejudice and discriminatory language and behaviour
- managing discussion about sensitive and controversial issues such as racism.

The role of the teacher in PSHE and Citizenship is frequently that of facilitator and supporter rather than instructor. Training should promote an understanding of how active learning cycles work so that pupils plan activities, participate in them and review them afterwards to establish what happened, what was learnt and how the learning can be applied to future situations.

Training should also help teachers of both Citizenship and PSHE to develop confidence in using participatory teaching and learning approaches such as discussion and debate, enquiry, role-play and simulation, use of ICT, using photographs and photography, learning from visits and visitors, involving pupils in issues or activities related to the wider community.

CPD can be effectively provided through opportunities for teachers to observe colleagues, through coaching and through the establishment of teacher networks as well as participatory courses and workshops. If the focus of such activities is the development of skills or the management of active learning they may be used to develop teacher competence in both Citizenship and PSHE (and indeed other subjects). If it is to illustrate how to plan and deliver specific knowledge and understanding, training provision may be better made separately.

## Conclusion

Some have seen the relationship between Citizenship and PSHE as a contest. This is damaging for both, confusing for schools and irrelevant to pupils. This chapter has attempted to illustrate that Citizenship and PSHE are both essential components of the school curriculum with complementary but different content, sometimes around common themes. Together they make a major contribution to the personal and social development of pupils, helping to prepare them for the opportunities, responsibilities and experiences of life.

By recognising their importance, clarifying their roles and planning rigorously for each, schools and those who support them can provide a curriculum that is valued by pupils as being relevant to their lives. Provision is

likely to be most effective where there are regular, discrete lessons for each of PSHE and Citizenship, complemented by planned and coordinated contributions within other subjects and aspects of school life. Whatever forms of provision are used, Citizenship and PSHE should be planned to ensure pupils are always clear about which subject they are being taught and assessed in. Including activities where areas of learning for Citizenship and for PSHE are linked around topical issues can help pupils make sense of them. However, trying to address all of both subjects through joint provision would prevent them from achieving their full entitlement to learning in both.

## REFERENCES

- Huddleston, T. and Kerr, D. (2006) *Making Sense of Citizenship: A CPD Handbook*. London: Citizenship Foundation/Hodder Murray.
- Ofsted (2003) *National Curriculum Citizenship: planning and implementation 2002/03*. London: HMI.
- QCA (1999) 'The school curriculum and the National Curriculum: values, aims and purposes', in *The National Curriculum: Handbook for secondary teachers in England*. London: QCA.
- QCA (2001) *Citizenship: A Scheme of Work for Key Stage 3 Teacher's Guide*. London: QCA.

## FURTHER READING

- Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation (2000) *PASSPORT: A framework for personal and social development*. London: Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation.
- Department for Education and Employment (1999) *Preparing Young People for Adult Life: A Report by the National Advisory Group on Personal, Social and Health Education*. London: DfEE.
- Department of Health and Department for Education and Employment (1999) *National Healthy School Standard: Getting Started*. London: DH/DfEE.
- Health Development Agency (2003) *Certification of the teaching of PSHE (Personal, Social and Health Education) Handbook*. London: Health Development Agency.
- QCA (1998) *Education for Citizenship and the Teaching of Democracy in Schools (the Crick Report)*. London: QCA.

## NOTES

- 1 It is likely that awarding bodies will offer a full GCSE course in Citizenship Studies and a full AS and A level qualification in Citizenship Studies from 2008.
- 2 The comment was contained in a letter from Professor Sir Bernard Crick, chair of the advisory group on Citizenship, to Professor John Tomlinson, chair of the advisory group for the Passport framework for Personal and Social Development, dated 12 May 1998.
- 3 Here the concepts might include democracy and autocracy; co-operation and conflict; equality and diversity; fairness, justice, the rule of law; rules, the law and human rights; freedom and order, individual and community; power and authority; rights and responsibilities.
- 4 'Exploring and discussing', 'participating' and 'having time to reflect' are all National Curriculum requirements for Citizenship at Key Stages 3 and 4.
- 5 This dual approach was first developed by Jan Newton, Don Rowe, Ted Huddleston and the team at the Citizenship Foundation.